Factual analysis of Member States Investors' Schemes granting citizenship or residence to thirdcountry nationals investing in the said Member State

Deliverable B.II Investors' Residence Schemes in Ireland

JUST/2016/RCIT/FW/RIGH/0152 (2017/06)





This Report has been prepared by Gillian Kelly for Milieu Ltd under the contract JUST/2016/RCIT/FW/RIGH/0152 (2017/06).

The views expressed herein are those of the consultants alone and do not necessarily represent the official views of the European Commission.

Milieu Ltd (Belgium), Chaussée de Charleroi 112, B-1060 Brussels, tel.: +32 2 506 1000; email: <u>emma.psaila@milieu.be</u>; <u>ana.gomez@milieu.be</u> and <u>vanessa.leigh@milieu.be</u>; web address: <u>www.milieu.be</u>.

Factual analysis of Member States Investors' Schemes granting citizenship or residence to third-country nationals investing in the said Member State

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	GENERAL BACKGROUND	1
II.	PROCEDURES, COMPETENT AUTHORITIES AND APPLICABLE CRITERIA	3
1	APPLICATION PHASE	3
2	TYPE OF INVESTMENT	. 10
3	RESIDENCE PHASE	. 12
4	DUE DILIGENCE CRITERIA AND SECURITY CONSIDERATIONS	. 16
III.	RIGHTS GRANTED BY THE PERMITS	. 19
1	RIGHTS GRANTED TO INVESTORS	. 19
2	RIGHTS GRANTED TO THE INVESTORS' FAMILY MEMBERS	. 19
3	OTHER BENEFITS	. 20
IV.	INTERACTION BETWEEN RESIDENCE AND CITIZENSHIP SCHEMES	. 21
۷.	ECONOMIC AND FINANCIAL EFFICIENCY OF RESIDENCE PERMITS FOR FOREIGN	
	INVESTORS	. 22

I. GENERAL BACKGROUND

Legal background

Investors may obtain residence in Ireland on the basis of the Immigrant Investor Programme (IIP)¹. The only reference in Irish legislation to the IIP is in the Immigration Act 2004 (Immigrant Investor Programme) (Application for Permission) (Fee) Regulations 2007². Article 2 of these Regulations stipulates that the 'Immigrant Investor Programme' means the programme of that name, approved by the Government on 24 January 2012, the guidelines for which are published on the website of the Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service'³. The Department of Justice and Equality introduced the IIP in 2012 to facilitate the granting of residence to non-EEA migrant entrepreneurs and investors who, in return for permission to reside in Ireland, are prepared to invest in the State⁴.

The Business Permission Scheme, which was also introduced in 2012 and since 16 March 2016 is no longer in operation, aimed to facilitate residence permission to non-EEA nationals coming to Ireland in order to establish a business that did not qualify for the Start-Up Entrepreneurship Programme (STEP) or a business that was intended for retail, personal services, catering or other businesses of this nature⁵.

It is also noted that Ireland operated a European investor citizenship programme from 1989 to 1994. According to Article 16(a) of the Irish Nationality and Citizenship Act 1956, exceptional naturalisation could be granted to people of 'Irish descent or Irish associations' while waiving other criteria⁶. The interpretation of 'Irish associations' allowed for the development of the Investment Based Naturalisation Scheme⁷. The scheme was terminated in 1994 due to the perception that Irish passports would become depreciated as the investors 'have little or no connection with Ireland and [...] no plans to strengthen those connections'⁸ but no legislative change took place. The 2002 Report of the Review Group on Investment Based Naturalisation considered such an interpretation of 'Irish associations' to be too broad. Article 10 of the Irish Nationality and Citizenship Act 2004 therefore limited the associations to relationship to an Irish citizen 'by blood, affinity or adoption' thus terminating the investor citizenship programme⁹.

⁸ Seanad Eireann Debate, 2002 Vol. 170 No. 26, available at: <u>http://oireachtasdebates.oireachtas.ie/</u>.

¹ Information obtained through consultation with national stakeholder (Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service, 17 April 2018).

² Immigration Act 2004 (Immigrant Investor Programme) (Application for Permission) (Fee) Regulations 2017, S.I. No. 10/2017, available at: <u>http://www.irishstatutebook.ie/eli/2017/si/10/made/en/print</u>.

³ Article 2 of the Immigration Act 2004 (Immigrant Investor Programme) (Application for Permission) (Fee) Regulations 2017, S.I. No. 10/2017, available at: <u>http://www.irishstatutebook.ie/eli/2017/si/10/made/en/print</u>.

⁴ Sarah Maguire, 'Immigrant Investor Programme and Start-up Entrepreneur Programme', April 2012, available at: <u>http://www.dilloneustace.com/download/1/The%20Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20and%20Start-</u> up%20Entrepreneur%20Programme.pdf.

⁵ European Migration Network, 'Admitting third-country nationals for business purposes: A study from the European Migration Network 2015', 2015, p. 44, available at: http://www.emn.lv/wp-content/uploads/emn_study_admitting_thirdcountry_nationals_for_business_purposes_synthesis_report_vf_04may2015.pdf.

⁶ Irish Nationality and Citizenship Act 1956, No. 26 of 1956, available at: <u>http://www.irishstatutebook.ie/eli/1956/act/26/enacted/en/html</u>.

⁷ Džankić, J., 2012, 'The pros and cons of ius pecuniae: investor citizenship in comparative perspective', Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies - EUDO Citizenship Observatory, Issue 14, p. 11, available at: http://cadmus.eui.eu/bitstream/handle/1814/21476/RSCAS_2012_14.pdf.

⁹ Džankić, J., 2012, 'The pros and cons of ius pecuniae: investor citizenship in comparative perspective', Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies - EUDO Citizenship Observatory, Issue 14, p. 11, available at: http://cadmus.eui.eu/bitstream/handle/1814/21476/RSCAS_2012_14.pdf; Džankić, J., 2015, 'Investment-based citizenship and residence programmes in the EU', Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies - EUDO Citizenship Observatory, Issue 8, p. 18, available at: http://cadmus.eui.eu/bitstream/handle/1814/34484/RSCAS_2015_08.pdf; Article 10 of the Irish Nationality and Citizenship 2004, 38 2004, available Act No of at: http://www.irishstatutebook.ie/eli/2004/act/38/enacted/en/print.html.

• Competent authorities

The Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service (INIS) within the Department of Justice and Equality has exclusive competence for regulating migration issues and issuing residence permits.

II. PROCEDURES, COMPETENT AUTHORITIES AND APPLICABLE CRITERIA

1 APPLICATION PHASE

1.1 **PROCEDURES**

Investors and business professionals from outside the EU¹⁰ who **undertake one of four eligible in-vestments** in Ireland (i.e. Enterprise Investment, Investment Fund, Real Estate Investment Fund (REIT) or Endowment), who are of **good character** and have **not been convicted of criminal offences** in any jurisdictions and who have a **minimum net worth of EUR 2 million** can apply for a residence permit under the IIP¹¹.

The procedure for granting investors residence permits under the IIP is described below.

1. Apply

Investors must apply to INIS by way of an **application form indicating which of the four investment options they wish to pursue** (there is no requirement that the funds be invested or committed before approval is given). The following investment options are included under the programme:

- Enterprise Investment: An investment into new or existing Irish businesses for a minimum of 3 years. The enterprise can be a start-up registered by the investor. The investment can be in a single Irish enterprise or spread over a number of enterprises. The enterprise must be registered and headquartered in Ireland and the investment must support the creation or maintenance of employment.
- **Investment Fund**: An investment in an approved investment fund for at least 3 years. Investment funds must invest in Irish businesses and projects.
- **REIT**: A REIT is a listed company, used to hold rental investment properties. It is a globally recognised standard for investment in rental property assets. The aim of a REIT is to provide an after-tax return for investors similar to that of direct investment in property, while also giving the benefits of risk diversification. To eliminate the double layer of taxation which typically hinders the holding of property through a company, a REIT is exempt from corporation tax on qualifying profits from rental property. Instead, the company is required to distribute the vast majority of its profits to investors each year for taxation at the level of the investor. The company must have a diverse ownership no one person or group of connected persons can control the REIT. The taxation provisions that permit REITs to operate in Ireland were provided for in the Finance Act 2013¹².
- **Endowment**: Endowment to a public project benefiting the arts, sports, health, culture or education¹³.

Investors must also **supply supporting documentation of evidence of their net worth** (minimum EUR 2 million) and their **good character** with their application¹⁴. Moreover, applicants must submit **documentation from their home country that attests that all anti-money laundering checks have been made** and all requirements have been complied with (e.g. they must provide an explanation of

¹⁰INIS, 'Immigrant Investor Programme: Guidelines', January 2018, available at: <u>http://www.inis.gov.ie/en/INIS/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf/Files/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf</u>.

¹¹ Ibid.

¹² Finance Act 2013, No. 8 of 2013, available at: <u>http://www.irishstatutebook.ie/eli/2013/act/8/enacted/en/html</u>.

¹³ INIS, 'Immigrant Investor Programme: Guidelines', January 2018, available at: http://www.inis.gov.ie/en/INIS/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf/Files/Immigrant%20Inv estor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf.

¹⁴ Ibid.

all of their activities for the previous 12 months, including their income, investments and loans, evidence of the funds that are to be used for the proposed investment, evidence of the provenance of those funds and evidence that the funds are transferrable to Ireland and are convertible to euros)¹⁵.

Applications, including the original application form and supporting documentation, must be submitted by email to IIP&STEPapplications@justice.ie to arrive no later than 5.00 pm on the advertised closing date¹⁶. The Original Signed Application Form, two colour photographs for the applicant and their nominated family members and the **application fee** of EUR 1,500 must also be forwarded by post to:

Investment and Start Up Entrepreneur Programmes, Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service, 13-14 Burgh Quay, Dublin 2, D02 XK70, Ireland and must also arrive no later than 5.00 pm on the advertised closing date¹⁷. This fee must be in the form of Irish Postal Orders or a Bankers Draft drawn on an Irish Financial Institution only – no cheques drawn on a foreign bank will be accepted. The fee should be made payable to the Secretary General of the Department of Justice and Equality. The EUR 1,500 fee covers the principal applicant and all nominated family members. Application fees are nonrefundable in the event of unsuccessful applications¹⁸.

2. Approval

The Evaluation Committee, made up of up of senior managers in other relevant government departments and state agencies, e.g. the Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade, the Department of Finance, Enterprise Ireland, the Industrial Development Authority, the Department of Business, Enterprise and Innovation, and INIS of the Department of Justice and Equality will then evaluate the proposal and will decide whether to approve it or not based on examining the conditions described below. The Committee will then inform the Minister for Justice and Equality as to whether or not the person and their proposal is acceptable under the programme¹⁹. The Minister will either approve or reject the recommendations. Where an application is rejected, INIS will communicate the reasons for that rejection in writing to the applicant²

If approved, a letter of approval will be sent to the applicant and will state that the application has been approved subject to the normal security and visa checks. Evidence of anti-money laundering checks is double-checked and verified by the Evaluation Committee. Moreover, when investors make an application for residence permission they also make an application for a visa and normal visa checks are done at that stage. Initially they have to make a single-entry visa application from their country of origin- if there is an issue at that stage- through normal visa and security checks then they will be refused admission to Ireland which means they will not be able to take up the approval granted. Once the applicants arrive at the counter of registration in Ireland, another visa and security check will be done because most of the applicants apply for a multi-entry visa and they get a stamp 4 visa on that basis²¹. The investment is made subject to the **applicant registering their residency permission** in person at INIS's registration office at Burgh Quay in Dublin²².

¹⁵ Information obtained through consultation with national stakeholder (Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service, 17 April 2018).

INIS, 'Immigrant Investor Programme: Guidelines', January 2018, p.30, available at: http://www.inis.gov.ie/en/INIS/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf/Files/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf/Files/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf/Files/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf/Files/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf/Files/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf/Files/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf/Files/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf/Files/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf/Files/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf/Files/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf/Files/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf/Files/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf/Files/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf/Files/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf/Files/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20Programme%20Files/Immigrant%20Programme%20Files/Immigrant%20File estor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf. ¹⁷ Ibid.

¹⁸ Ibid.

¹⁹ Information obtained through consultation with national stakeholder (Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service, 17 April 2018).

INIS. 'Immigrant Investor Programme: Guidelines', January 2018, p.23, available at: http://www.inis.gov.ie/en/INIS/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf/Files/Immigrant%20Inv estor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf. ²¹ Information obtained through consultation with national stakeholder (Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service, 17

April 2018).

²² Information obtained through consultation with national stakeholder (Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service, 17 April 2018).

3. Invest

Once the application is approved, an investment should then be made into the applicant's preferred investment option²³. The financial thresholds for the four different types of investment are²⁴:

- Enterprise Investment: A minimum EUR 1 million aggregate investment for a minimum of 3 years;
- **Investment Fund**: A minimum of EUR 1 million investment in an approved investment fund for a minimum of 3 years;
- **REIT**: A minimum investment of EUR 2 million in any Irish REIT listed on the Irish Stock Exchange. The EUR 2 million investment may be spread across a number of different Irish REITs;
- **Endowment**: A minimum endowment of EUR 500,000. The endowment can be EUR 400,000 per investor if it is pooled in by at least five individuals.

4. Reside

When the applicant has provided verifiable evidence that he/she has invested his/her funds, he/she and their nominated family members will be granted residency permission in Ireland²⁵. Permission to remain in Ireland for non-EU nationals is granted by INIS and consists of a **special residence stamp** (for IIP applicants and their family members - a stamp 4) on their passport²⁶. If an applicant and his/her family members are granted permission to remain, a Certificate of Registration called an Irish Residence Permit is granted²⁷. An Irish Residence Permit costs EUR 300 per person each time (i.e. on registration and renewal)²⁸.

For the IIP, successful applicants and their family members (if applicable) are given initial residence permission for two years. Following a review at that point to ensure the investor still meets the conditions of the scheme, a further period of three years will be granted. After this initial five-year period, the investor will be free to apply for residence indefinitely in five year periods²⁹. There is **no minimum residence requirement other than that the persons concerned spend at least one day in Ireland every year**. Therefore, the investor is not required to establish actual residence/physical presence in Ireland. There is also **no residency condition for renewing** their permission³⁰.

There are a number of other conditions for granting residence to investors. Key requirements considered by the Evaluation Committee for approval of applications for the IIP are that the project would be beneficial for Ireland, good for job creation, be in the public interest and that the

²³ Ibid.

²⁴ INIS, 'Immigrant Investor Programme: Guidelines', January 2018, p.6-9, available at: http://www.inis.gov.ie/en/INIS/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf/Files/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf.

²⁵ INIS, 'Immigrant Investor Programme: Guidelines', January 2018, available at: http://www.inis.gov.ie/en/INIS/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf/Files/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf.

²⁶ 'Residence rights of non-EEA nationals', Citizens Information Website, available at: http://www.citizensinformation.ie/en/moving_country/moving_to_ireland/rights_of_residence_in_ireland/residence_rights_o f_non_eea_nationals_in_ireland.html; 'Registration fee, payment & exemptions', Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service Website, available at: http://www.inis.gov.ie/en/INIS/Pages/registration-fees.

²⁷ 'Residence rights of non-EEA nationals', Citizens Information Website, available at: http://www.citizensinformation.ie/en/moving_country/moving_to_ireland/rights_of_residence_in_ireland/residence_rights_o f_non_eea nationals in ireland.html; 'Registration fee, payment & exemptions', Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service Website, available at: http://www.inis.gov.ie/en/INIS/Pages/registration-fees.

²⁸ 'Registration fee, payment & exemptions', Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service Website, available at: <u>http://www.inis.gov.ie/en/INIS/Pages/registration-fees</u>.

²⁹ Kathleen Garrett, 'Immigrant Investor Programme', January 2017, p. 1, available at: <u>http://www.arthurcox.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/Immigrant-Investor-Programme-January-2017.pdf</u>.

³⁰INIS, 'Immigrant Investor Programme: Guidelines', January 2018, p.26, available at: http://www.inis.gov.ie/en/INIS/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf/Files/Immigrant%20Inv estor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf; Information obtained through consultation with national stakeholder (Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service, April 2018).

funds invested are legally acquired and owned by the investor (i.e. not borrowed). It is also essential that applicants be of good character and must not have been convicted of criminal offences in any jurisdiction³¹. Moreover, they must have a minimum net worth of EUR 2 million and be able to provide evidence of this³².

The conditions for residency renewal under the IIP are:

- the investment remained in place for the required time (minimum 3 years);
- the applicant has not become a financial burden on Ireland;
- the applicant has not been investigated, indicted, or convicted in relation to any criminal offence in any country³³.

Article 3 of the Immigrant Act 2004 (Immigrant Investor Programme) (Application for Permission) (Fee) Regulations 2017 stipulates that 'the amount of \notin 1500 is prescribed as the fee in respect of the making of an application for a permission under the Immigrant Investor Programme³⁴. Therefore, this **fee** must be paid by the applicant to INIS in addition to the investment³⁵.

Applications can be **turned down** for a number of reasons. INIS do not accept applications for office accommodation, office space, office buildings and private residential property. This is due to the fact that these are schemes that will happen in the Irish market regardless of the IIP³⁶. Moreover, sale of property or stimulation of the property market is not of itself an objective of the programme³⁷. Therefore, applications of this kind will be turned down. Applications will also be turned down if the Evaluation Committee are not satisfied that the proposal is genuinely innovative, is beneficial to Ireland, will create jobs and has significant export potential. For instance, if there was an application for a social housing scheme and there was already a contracted social housing scheme in the area, INIS would not duplicate this and therefore an application like this may be refused³⁸.

There are no **legal remedies** which apply in the case of refusal of residence³⁹. The decision of the Minister for Justice and Equality on an application is final and a rejection of an application for residence under the IIP is not subject to a review or appeal. That does not however prevent the person concerned from making a new application for another project at a later date as it is the project itself that does not get approval and therefore the same person can re-apply through another project⁴⁰.

Applicants may have access to judicial review to seek a review of the process (not the decision). However, there have been no requests for judicial review to date⁴¹.

³¹ Padraig Hoare, 'Immigrant investor scheme approvals down', 26 January 2017, Press Release, available at: <u>https://www.irishex.aminer.com/business/immigrant-investor-scheme-approvals-down-440864.html;</u> Kathleen Garrett, 'Immigrant Investor Programme', January 2017, p. 3, available at: <u>http://www.arthurcox.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/Immigrant-Investor-Programme-January-2017.pdf</u>.

³² 'Coming to set-up a business in Ireland', Citizens Information Website, available at: <u>http://www.citizensinformation.ie/en/employment/types of employment/self employment/coming to set up a business i</u> <u>n ireland.html</u>.

³³ 'Permanent Residency by Investment in Ireland', Elma Global Website, available at: <u>https://www.second-citizenship.org/permanent-residence/permanent-residency-by-investment-in-ireland/</u>.

³⁴ Article 2 of the Immigration Act 2004 (Immigrant Investor Programme) (Application for Permission) (Fee) Regulations 2017, S.I. No. 10/2017, available at: <u>http://www.irishstatutebook.ie/eli/2017/si/10/made/en/print</u>.

³⁵ 'Ireland Investor Residency', Invest in Migration Website, available at: <u>https://www.investmentimmigration.com/ireland-investor-residency/</u>.

³⁶ Information obtained through consultation with national stakeholder (Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service, 17 April 2018).

³⁷ INIS, 'Immigrant Investor Programme: Guidelines', January 2018, p.27, available at: http://www.inis.gov.ie/en/INIS/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf/Files/Immigrant%20Inv estor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf.

³⁸ Information obtained through consultation with national stakeholder (Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service, 17 April 2018).

³⁹ Ibid.

⁴⁰ Ibid.

⁴¹ Ibid.

1.2 COMPETENT AUTHORITIES AND NON-PUBLIC BODIES

INIS within the Department of Justice and Equality has exclusive competence for regulating migration issues, carrying out visa checks and issuing residence permits. INIS receives the applications, does the secretariat work and gets the applications ready to be reviewed by the Evaluation Committee⁴². The **Evaluation Committee** convenes at least four times per year, to assess applications for residency under the IIP and provides considerations and recommendations to the **Minister for Justice and Equality** as to whether to approve applications or not⁴³. As indicated under point 1.1 above, the Evaluation Committee is made up of senior managers in relevant government departments and state agencies (i.e. public bodies) involved in Enterprise and Development, e.g. the Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade, the Department of Finance, INIS, Enterprise Ireland, the Industrial Development Authority and the Department of Business, Enterprise and Innovation⁴⁴.

All Government officials from all Ministries are available to the Committee should INIS have an issue with an application that they want further information or clarification on⁴⁵. This usually applies where a project has a specific science, educational or housing need. For instance, if there was an application for a social housing scheme and there was already a contracted social housing scheme in the area, INIS would not duplicate this and therefore an application like this may be refused under a recommendation from the Department of Housing⁴⁶. Therefore, INIS would refer to the Department of Housing for more information or to make sure they are not doubling up on what is already available⁴⁷.

As indicated in point 4 below, most due diligence and security checks (e.g. anti-money laundering) are done by **independent professionals** (e.g. banks, accountants, solicitors) in the applicant's home country and evidence of such checks is submitted with the investor's application form. These documents (e.g. evidence that the investment threshold can be met (i.e. minimum EUR 1 million: Enterprise Investment and Investment Fund; minimum EUR 2 million: REIT and minimum EUR 500,000: Endowment), evidence that the money can be transferred and evidence of good character) are rechecked by the Evaluation Committee at application stage. Besides these independent professionals, no other non-public bodies are involved in the procedure.

1.3 MONITORING OF THE PROCEEDINGS AND THE AUTHORITIES INVOLVED

There is currently no cap on the number of residence permits that may be granted under the IIP⁴⁸.

No specific scrutiny exists from parliamentary or other committees and bodies on the number of successful applications⁴⁹ and there are no reporting obligations in place.

As stated under points 1.1 and 1.2 above, all of the applications and recommendations for approval go to the Minister for Justice and Equality for his decision and signature⁵⁰.

⁴² Ibid.

⁴³ INIS, 'Immigrant Investor Programme: Guidelines', January 2018, p. 19 available at: <u>http://www.inis.gov.ie/en/INIS/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf/Files/Immigrant%20Inv</u> <u>estor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf</u>.

⁴⁴ Information obtained through consultation with national stakeholder (Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service, 17 April 2018).

⁴⁵ Ibid.

⁴⁶ Ibid.

⁴⁷ Ibid. ⁴⁸ Ibid.

⁴⁹ Ibid.

⁵⁰ Ibid

INFORMATION ON APPLICATIONS 1.4

There is **no obligation to disclose information about successful applicants**. Such information is not published⁵¹. This is to protect applicants' identities and the commercial sensitivities around the projects the applicants involve themselves in⁵². For example, if such information was published before a project commenced it could have an adverse effect on the project⁵³. However, where information is requested through freedom of information or a parliamentary question, INIS do provide some information (e.g. the number and value of IIP applications per annum since 2012 under each investment option⁵⁴, the number and value of immigrant investor programme applications for social housing investment and nursing home investment in 2017⁵⁵, the criteria against which applications are evaluated⁵⁶, the number of applications approved under the IIP⁵⁷, the investment funds for which applications under the IIP have been approved to date⁵⁸, the four investment options available under the programme⁵⁹, the amount of money invested in the IIP⁶⁰, the members of the Evaluation Committee⁶¹. Not all the details are provided in order to ensure that the investor's data protection rights are not breached⁶².

A breakdown of the number and value of IIP applications per annum under each investment **option** is provided in Table 1 below⁶³.

Year	Endowment	Enterprise	Mixed Invest- ment	Bond	Other
2012	2 (€1.0m)	3 (€3.0m)	-	-	-
2013	2 (€1.0m)	9 (€4.5m)	7 (€5.25m)	2 (€2.0m)	-
2014	-	26 (€13.0m)	3 (€2.25m)	1 (€1.0m)	-
2015	1 (€0.5m)	56 (€28.0m)	4 (€3.0m)	3 (€3.0m)	3 (€1.5m) Fund
2016	5 (€2.0m)	249 (€124.5m)	28 (€21.0m)	10 (€10.0m)	24 (€24.0m) Fund 1 (€2.0m) REIT
2017	46 (€19.2m)	261 (€261.0m)	-	-	26 (€26.0m) Fund 1 (€2.0m) REIT

Table 1 IIP applications per annum under each investment option

⁵¹ Information obtained through consultation with national stakeholder (Central Statistics Office Ireland, 12 April 2018).

⁵² Information obtained through consultation with national stakeholder (Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service, 17 April 2018).

⁵³ Ibid

⁵⁴ 'Parliamentary Question 262: 23 January 2018', Department of Justice and Equality website, available at: http://www.justice.ie/en/JELR/Pages/PQ-23-01-2018-262.

⁵⁵ 'Immigrant Investor Programme Data: Dail Eireann Debate, Tuesday 27 March 2018', Houses of the Oireachtas Website, available at: https://www.oireachtas.ie/en/debates/question/2018-03-27/286/.

⁵⁶ Ibid.

⁵⁷ 'Parliamentary Question 263: 3 October 2017', 'Department of Justice and Equality Website, available at: http://www.justice.ie/en/JELR/Pages/PQ-03-10-2017-263.

^{&#}x27;Parliamentary Question 99: 8 February 2017', 'Department of Justice and Equality Website, available at: http://www.justice.ie/en/JELR/Pages/PQ-08-02-2017-99.

⁵⁹ 'Immigrant Investor Programme Data: Dail Eireann Debate, Tuesday 15 May 2018', Houses of the Oireachtas Website, available at: https://www.oireachtas.ie/en/debates/question/2018-05-15/289/.

⁶⁰ 'Parliamentary Question 2271/17', Parliamentary Questions Website, available at: <u>http://www.parliamentary-</u> <u>questions.com/question/2271-17/.</u> ⁶¹ 'Parliamentary Question 263: 3 October 2017', 'Department of Justice and Equality Website, available at:

http://www.justice.ie/en/JELR/Pages/PQ-03-10-2017-263.

⁶² Information obtained through consultation with national stakeholder (Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service, 17 April 2018).

⁶³ 'Parliamentary Question 262: 23 January 2018', Department of Justice and Equality website, available at: http://www.justice.ie/en/JELR/Pages/PQ-23-01-2018-262.

As can be seen from the table above, the number of applications overall in 2015 was 67, this increased to 317 in 2016, an almost 500% increase presumably as a result of the required level of investment introduced in 2012 of EUR 1 million being reduced to EUR 500,000 in order to stimulate interest in the programme⁶⁴. This rate of applications continued in 2017 however, with 334 applications received, despite the investment threshold being returned to the original level of EUR 1 million⁶⁵.

With regard to the number of successful applications under the IIP, five applications were approved in 2012, 14 applications were approved in 2013, 23 applications were approved in 2014 and 65 applications were approved in 2015⁶⁶. Since June 2016 a total of 506 applications have been submitted and 482 have been decided with 24 awaiting final decision⁶⁷. The Evaluation Committee has recommended approval in respect of 405 of these applications for a total investment value of EUR 285.45m⁶⁸. No further information regarding successful applications in 2016 and 2017 is available.

1.5 INFORMATION ON APPLICATIONS BY FAMILY MEMBERS

Residency under the IIP is also available to the applicant's non-EEA spouses/partners and children under 18 years of age for whom the applicant and/or their spouse or partner has legal guardianship⁶⁹. In certain cases, children between the ages of 18 and 24 will be considered where they are unmarried and are financially dependent on their parents⁷⁰. Applicants should provide the following evidence of their family relationships with their initial application⁷¹:

- *Spouses*: Applicants should provide evidence that their marriage or civil partnership is legal.
- *Partners*: Applicants should provide evidence that they have been cohabiting with their partner in a common law/de facto relationship for the previous two years⁷².
- *Children*: The minor children of the applicant qualify for residency status provided that the applicant qualifies for residency status and provided that they are **legally** in the custody/guardianship of the applicant. In certain cases, children between the ages of 18 and 24 will be considered for residence under the programme where they are unmarried and are not in a de facto/common law relationship; or they are financially dependent upon their parents (e.g. they are in full time education)⁷³

In respect of each child, the applicant must supply birth certificates detailing parentage or legal documentation verifying the applicant's custody/guardianship⁷⁴.

No statistical data on the number of applications for residence permits by family members is available.

⁶⁴ Ibid; 'Parliamentary Question 2271/17', Parliamentary Questions Website, available at: http://www.parliamentary-questions.com/question/2271-17/.

⁶⁵ 'Parliamentary Question 262: 23 January 2018', Department of Justice and Equality website, available at: http://www.justice.ie/en/JELR/Pages/PQ-23-01-2018-262.

⁶⁶ 'Parliamentary Question 2271/17', Parliamentary Questions Website, available at: http://www.parliamentary-questions.com/question/2271-17/.

 ⁶⁷ 'Parliamentary Question 263: 3 October 2017', 'Department of Justice and Equality Website, available at: http://www.justice.ie/en/JELR/Pages/PQ-03-10-2017-263.
 ⁶⁸ Ibid.

⁶⁹ Kathleen Garrett, 'Immigrant Investor Programme', January 2017, p. 2, available at: <u>http://www.arthurcox.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/Immigrant-Investor-Programme-January-2017.pdf;</u> INIS, 'Immigrant Investor Programme : Guide-lines', January 2018, p. 22, available at: <u>http://www.inis.gov.ie/en/INIS/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf/Files/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf.</u>

⁷⁰ Ibid.

⁷¹ Ibid.

⁷² Ibid.

⁷³ Ibid.

⁷⁴ Ibid, at p.23.

2 TYPE OF INVESTMENT⁷⁵

Type of investment required	Applicability of financial thresh- old	Procedure to verify the fulfilment of the investment cri- terion	Competent authorities and non-public bodies
The IIP guidelines provided by INIS ⁷⁶	The financial thresholds for the	Checks on the fulfilment of the investment criterion are	The competent authori-
indicate that the following types of in-	different types of investment	done at various stages .	ties involved in checking
vestment are included under the pro-	are ⁷⁷ :		the fulfilment of the
gramme:	1. Immigrant investor bonds	Anti-money laundering checks are done by inde-	investment criterion are
1. Immigrant investor bonds (temporarily	(temporarily suspended): in-	pendent professionals in the applicant's home country	INIS and the Evaluation
suspended since 18 July 2016) is a gov-	vestment of EUR 1 million	and evidence of these checks is submitted with the	Committee. Independ-
ernment guaranteed investment.		application form. With their application form, appli-	ent professionals in the
	2. Enterprise Investment: A min-	cants must therefore submit evidence that they have	applicant's home coun-
2. Enterprise Investment: An investment	imum EUR 1 million aggregate	legally acquired a minimum net worth of EUR 2 million	try are also involved in
into new or existing Irish businesses for a	investment for a minimum of 3	(for the IIP), provide an explanation of all activities for	carrying out anti-money
minimum of 3 years. The enterprise can	years	the previous 12 months including their income, invest-	laundering checks.
be a start-up registered by the investor.		ments and loans, evidence of the funds that are to be	
The investment can be in a single lrish	3. Investment Fund: A minimum	used for the proposed investment, evidence of the	All of the applications
enterprise or spread over a number of	of EUR 1 million investment in an	provenance of those funds and evidence that the	and recommendations
enterprises. The enterprise must be regis-	approved investment fund for a minimum of 3 years	funds are transferrable to Ireland and are convertible to euros ⁷⁹ . INIS have a list of specific information they	for approval go to the Minister for Justice and
tered and headquartered in Ireland and the investment must support the	minimum of 5 years	require in relation to the following four sources of funds:	Equality for his decision
creation or maintenance of employ-	4. REIT: A minimum investment	business and investment activities, deeds of sale, inher-	and signature ⁸⁵ . There
ment.	of EUR 2 million in any Irish REIT	itance, and divorce settlements. If the funding has	are no other scrutiny or
mem.	listed on the Irish Stock Ex-	been received from an alternative source the individ-	reporting mechanisms in
3. Investment Fund: An investment in an	change. The EUR 2 million in-	ual must provide original documentation and inde-	place ⁸⁶ .
approved investment fund for at least 3	vestment may be spread across	pendent supporting documentation as evidence.	
years. Investment funds must invest in	a number of different Irish REITs.		
Irish businesses and projects.		To demonstrate the legal source of the assets, appli-	
	5. Mixed investment (temporari-	cants should give details of bank accounts, term de-	
4. Real Estate Investment Trust (REIT): A	ly suspended): A Mixed Invest-	posits, stocks and other investments, real estate hold-	
REIT is a listed company, used to hold	ment comprises of a purchase	ings, businesses and other securities (insurance, security	
rental investment properties. It is a	of a Residential Property in Ire-	deposits, pension funds etc.). Applicants should also	

 ⁷⁵ For the purposes of this Table, the term 'investment' covers any pecuniary disbursement required as part of the process for obtaining residence under the investors' residence scheme.

 ⁷⁶ INIS,
 'Immigrant
 Investor
 Programme:
 Guidelines',
 January
 2018,
 available

 <u>http://www.inis.gov.ie/en/INIS/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf/Files/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Files/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Files/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Files/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Files/Imm</u>

⁷⁹ Information obtained through consultation with national stakeholder (Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service, 17 April 2018).

at:

Type of investment required	Applicability of financial thresh- old	Procedure to verify the fulfilment of the investment cri- terion	Competent authorities and non-public bodies
globally recognised standard for in- vestment in rental property assets. The aim of a REIT is to provide an after-tax return for investors similar to that of di- rect investment in property, while also giving the benefits of risk diversification. To eliminate the double layer of taxa- tion which typically hinders the holding of property through a company, a REIT is exempt from corporation tax on quali- fying profits from rental property. In-	land with a minimum value of EUR 450,000 combined with a	terion give details of their short term and long-term liabilities (accounts payable, taxes due, bank loans, long term debt including mortgages, etc.) ⁸⁰ . Applicants are only required to transfer the appropri- ate funds to their preferred investment option when their application has been approved by the Minister for Justice ⁸¹ . Evidence needs to be provided to show they have actually transferred the money to the pro- ject/fund/etc. ⁸² . A full check is made by the Evaluation Committee at this stage to ensure that the money was	and non-public bodies
stead, the company is required to dis- tribute the vast majority of its profits to investors each year for taxation at the level of the investor. The company must have a diverse ownership – no one per- son or group of connected persons can control the REIT. The taxation provisions that permit REITs to operate in Ireland were provided for in the Finance Act 2013.	Moreover, an application fee of EUR 1,500 applies ⁷⁸ .	theirs, that it has been handed over and that the in- vestment will be utilised for the purpose for which it was applied for ⁸³ . After the Evaluation Committee complete the initial check that the money has been actually transferred to the relevant entity, further checks will then be carried out by INIS on year two and year five. As such invest- ments under this programme are a three-year com- mitment, after year two INIS will conduct checks to ensure that the investment that was made has been utilised for the purpose for which it was granted. On	
rarily suspended as of 18 July 2016): A Mixed Investment comprises of a pur- chase of a Residential Property in Ire-		year five, INIS will check whether the third year hap- pened, whether the investors got their money back (as they have the entitlement to get their money back	

⁸⁵ Information obtained through consultation with national stakeholder (Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service, 17 April 2018).
 ⁸⁶ Ibid.

	1010.									
78	INIS	, 'Immigrant	Investor	Programme:	Guidelines',	January	2018,	p.9,	available	at:
h	tp://www.inis.go	ov.ie/en/INIS/Immigrant%20	Investor%20Progra	mme%20(IIP)%20Guide	elines.pdf/Files/Immigrant	%20Investor%20	Programme%20(II	P)% 20Guidelin	<u>nes.pdf</u> .	
80	INIS,	'Immigrant Inv	vestor Pi	ogramme: G	uidelines', Jar	nuary	2018, p	o.26,	available	at:
h	tp://www.inis.go	ov.ie/en/INIS/Immigrant%20	Investor%20Progra	mme%20(IIP)%20Guide	elines.pdf/Files/Immigrant	%20Investor%20	Programme%20(II	P)%20Guidelin	<u>ies.pdf</u> .	
81	INIS,	'Immigrant	Investor	Programme:	Guidelines',	January	2018,		available	at:
	http://www.inis.gov.ie/en/INIS/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf/Files/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf.									
82	Information obt	ained through consultation v	vith national stakeho	older (Irish Naturalisation	n and Immigration Service	, 17 April 2018).				
83	Ibid.									

Type of investment required	Applicability of financial thresh- old	Procedure to verify the fulfilment of the investment cri- terion	Competent authorities and non-public bodies
land with a minimum value of EUR 450,000 combined with a EUR 500,000		over a particular period).	
investment in the Immigrant Investor Bond. It must be held for 5 years.		Investments made under the IIP may be made for more than three years. It depends on the financial	
6. Endowment: Endowment to a public		agreement that the investors make with the project developer or the fund. If this is the case, further checks	
project benefiting the arts, sports, health, culture or education.		would need to be carried out by INIS ⁸⁴ .	

3 RESIDENCE PHASE

Residence permit	Procedure	Competent au- thorities and non- public bodies	Renewal of the resi- dence permit
Permission to remain in Ireland for non-EU nationals is granted by INIS and consists of a special residence stamp (for IIP applicants and their family members - a stamp 4) on their passport ⁸⁷ .	No person will get a residence permission (issued by INIS) unless they have actually transferred the mon- ey to the relevant entity. There is no minimum resi- dence requirement other than that the persons	The competent authority involved in checking the fulfilment of the	The applicant and dependent family members under the IIP will receive a two-year
According to section 4(1) of the Immigration Act 2004, 'subject to the provisions of this Act, an immigration officer may, on behalf of the Minister, give to a non-national a document , or place on his or her passport or other equiva-	concerned spend at least one day in Ireland every year. Therefore, the investor is not required to estab- lish actual residence/physical presence in Ireland ⁹⁹ . There is also no residency condition for renewing their permission.	residence criterion is INIS. All of the applications and recommendations for approval go to	residency permission under "Stamp 4" con- ditions, after two years, an extension (i.e. resi- dency renewal) will be
lent document an inscription , authorising the non-national to land or be in the State (referred to in this Act as "a per- mission") ¹⁸⁸ . Moreover, Section 4(7) of the Immigration Act 2004 pro-	The applicant must apply in person to INIS for residency permission and when applying for renewal of their residency permit ¹⁰⁰ .	the Minister for Justice and Equali- ty for his decision and signature ¹¹⁰ . There are no other	granted for an addi- tional three years, and then every five years indefinitely into the future ¹¹² . Such resi-

⁸⁴ Ibid.

⁸⁷ 'Residence rights of non-EEA nationals', Citizens Information Website, available at: <u>http://www.citizensinformation.ie/en/moving_country/moving_to_ireland/rights_of_residence_in_ireland/residence_rights_of_non_eea_nationals_in_ireland.html;</u> 'Registration fee, payment & exemptions', Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service Website, available at: <u>http://www.inis.gov.ie/en/INIS/Pages/registration-fees</u>.
⁸⁸ Section 4(1) of the Immigration Act 2004, No.1 of 2004, available at: <u>http://www.irishstatutebook.ie/eli/2004/act/1/enacted/en/print</u>.

Residence permit	Procedure	Competent au- thorities and non- public bodies	Renewal of the resi- dence permit
vides that 'a permission under this section may be re- newed or varied by the Minister, or by an immigration officer on his or her behalf, on application therefor by the non-national concerned ¹⁸⁹ .	Section 4(2) of the Immigration Act 2004 stipulates that 'a non-national coming by air or sea from a place outside the State shall, on arrival in the State, present himself or herself to an immigration officer and apply for a permission' ¹⁰¹ . According to the	scrutiny or report- ing mechanisms in place ¹¹¹ .	dency renewal appli- cations under the IIP are made to INIS ¹¹³ .
If an applicant and his/her family members are granted permission to remain, a Certificate of Registration called an Irish Residence Permit is granted ⁹⁰ . From 11 December 2017 all existing registration certificates known as 'Garda	Immigration Act 2004 'permission' means 'authoris- ing the non-national to land or be in the State' ¹⁰² . Moreover, Section 4(5)(c) provides that 'A non- national to whom this subsection applies and who is		dency renewal under the IIP are:
National Immigration Bureau (GNIB) cards' are being re- placed by the new Irish Residence Permit ⁹¹ . The Irish Resi- dence Permit does not give the applicant any new rights or entitlements ⁹² .	arriving in the State to engage in employment, business or a profession in the State shall within 7 days of entering the State— (i) report in person to the registration officer for the place in which he or she intends to reside () ¹⁰³ .		remained in place for the required time (minimum 3 years);
Section 9(2)(f) of the Immigration Act 2004 provides that: '(f) he or she shall— (i) subject to section 19 (3) (concerning fees), on registra- tion obtain from the registration officer a registration certif- icate;	The applicant must continue to spend a minimum of one day per year in Ireland ¹⁰⁴ . Therefore, INIS would check on the second and fifth year whether the investor came and visited Ireland once a year		 the applicant has not become a fi- nancial burden on Ireland;
(ii) on every subsequent alteration or addition of any entry in the register relating to his or her registration, produce the certificate to the registration officer in order that, if	and the applicant would have to show documen- tary proof e.g. flights, hotel rooms, shopping re- ceipts, etc. that they did stay in Ireland overnight ¹⁰⁵ .		the applicant has not been investi- gated, indicted, or

⁹⁹ INIS,	'Immigrant	Investor	Programme:	Guidelines',	January	2018,	p.26,	available	at:
http://www.in	is.gov.ie/en/INIS/Imm	igrant%20Investor%20	Programme%20(IIP)%	620Guidelines.pdf/Files/I	mmigrant%20Inves	tor%20Programme%	<u>%20(IIP)%20Guide</u>	<u>elines.pdf;</u> Ir	nformation
obtained throu	ugh consultation with n	ational stakeholder (Ir	ish Naturalisation and	Immigration Service, Apr	il 2018).				
¹⁰⁰ Informatio	on obtained through con	nsultation with national	l stakeholder (Irish Nat	uralisation and Immigrati	on Service, 17 Apri	1 2018).			
¹¹⁰ Informatio	on obtained through con	nsultation with national	l stakeholder (Irish Nat	turalisation and Immigrati	on Service, 17 Apri	1 2018).			
¹¹² Ibid.									
⁸⁹ Section 4(7) of the Immigration A	ct 2004, No.1 of 2004,	available at: http://ww	ww.irishstatutebook.ie/eli/	2004/act/1/enacted/e	e <u>n/print</u> .			
90 '	Residence r	ights of	non-EEA	nationals',	Citizens	Information	Website,	available	at:
http://www.ci	tizensinformation.ie/er	<u>/moving_country/mov</u>	ing_to_ireland/rights_	of_residence_in_ireland/r	esidence_rights_of_	non_eea_nationals_	in_ireland.html; 1	Registration fee, p	ayment &
exemptions', Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service Website, available at: http://www.inis.gov.ie/en/INIS/Pages/registration-fees.									
⁹¹ 'How the Iı	⁹¹ 'How the Irish immigration system works', Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service website, available at: <u>http://www.inis.gov.ie/en/INIS/Pages/about-registration-system#gnib-card</u> .								
⁹² Ibid.									

Residence permit	Procedure	Competent au- thorities and non- public bodies	Renewal of the resi- dence permit
 necessary, a corresponding alteration or addition may be made in the certificate⁹³. Moreover, Section 9(5) indicates that 'a registration certificate shall be in such form and contain such particulars as may be prescribed¹⁹⁴. The Irish Residence Permit (i.e. registration certificate) is in the form of a credit-card sized plastic card and displays basic information about the applicant including: His/her name, date of birth and registration number; A brief description of the applicant's immigration permission, including his/her permission stamp number (for applicants of the IIP this will be stamp 4); A microchip with a copy of his/her photograph and fingerprints⁹⁵. 	In order to ensure that the residence permission would be extended for a further three years, INIS will also check and ensure on year two that: a. The designated investment is still in place; b. The individual or their family have not become a financial burden on Ireland; and c. The individual or their family have not been inves- tigated, indicted or convicted in relation to any criminal offence in any jurisdiction ¹⁰⁶ . At the two-year check, if the investor has not utilised the investment, further residence permission could be refused by INIS on the basis that the investment was not used to the benefit of Ireland, i.e. the crea- tion of jobs and commercial activity and INIS could therefore refuse a transaction at that stage ¹⁰⁷ . Similarly, after the initial five years, the residence permission will be extended by INIS for a further five		convicted in rela- tion to any criminal offence in any country. There is no require- ment to create jobs under the IIP. There is no condition for busi- ness performance (success of business). The Government of Ireland recognizes that some of the businesses may not be successful or profitable; and this will not jeopardize the Irish Residency Permit received under the programme ¹¹⁴ .

¹⁰¹ Section 4(2) of the Immigration Act 2004, No.1 of 2004, available at: <u>http://www.irishstatutebook.ie/eli/2004/act/1/enacted/en/print</u> .									
¹⁰² Section 4(1) of the Immigration Act 2004, No.1 of 2004, available at: http://www.irishstatutebook.ie/eli/2004/act/1/enacted/en/print.									
¹⁰³ Section 4(5)	¹⁰³ Section 4(5)(c) of the Immigration Act 2004, No.1 of 2004, available at: <u>http://www.irishstatutebook.ie/eli/2004/act/1/enacted/en/print</u> .								
¹⁰⁴ INIS,	'Immigrant	Investor	Programme:	Guidelines',	January	2018,	p.26,	available	at:
http://www.inis	http://www.inis.gov.ie/en/INIS/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf/Files/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf.								
¹⁰⁵ Information obtained through consultation with national stakeholder (Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service, 17 April 2018).									
¹¹¹ Ibid.									

113 Ibid.

⁹³ Section 9(2)(f) of the Immigration Act 2004, No.1 of 2004, available at: <u>http://www.irishstatutebook.ie/eli/2004/act/1/enacted/en/print</u>.
 ⁹⁴ Section 9(5) of the Immigration Act 2004, No.1 of 2004, available at: <u>http://www.irishstatutebook.ie/eli/2004/act/1/enacted/en/print</u>.

95 'Irish Residence Permit (IRP)', Irish Immigration and Naturalisation Service Website, available at: http://www.inis.gov.ie/en/INIS/Pages/irish-residence-permit.

¹⁰⁶ Kathleen Garrett, 'Immigrant Investor Programme', January 2017, p. 1, available at: http://www.arthurcox.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/Immigrant-Investor-Programme-January-2017.pdf.

 ¹⁰⁷ Information obtained through consultation with national stakeholder (Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service, 17 April 2018).
 ¹¹⁴ 'Permanent Residency by Investment in Ireland', Elma Global Website, available at: https://www.second-citizenship.org/permanent-residence/permanent-residency-by-investment-in- ireland/.

Residence permit	Procedure	Competent au- thorities and non- public bodies	Renewal of the resi- dence permit
 Section 19(1) of the Immigration Act 2004 provides that: '(a) There shall be paid to the Minister by the non-national concerned in respect of the giving of a permission a fee of such amount as may be prescribed with the consent of the Minister for Finance. (b) There shall be paid to the registration officer concerned by the non-national concerned in respect of the issue of a registration certificate a fee of such amount as may be prescribed with the consent of the Minister for Finance. (c) There shall be paid to the Minister by the non-national concerned in respect of the issue of a travel document a fee of such amount as may be prescribed with the consent of the Minister for Finance. (c) There shall be paid to the Minister by the non-national concerned in respect of the issue of a travel document a fee of such amount as may be prescribed with the consent of the Minister for Finance. (c) There shall be paid to the Insister by the non-national concerned in respect of the issue of a travel document a fee of such amount as may be prescribed with the consent of the Minister for Finance'⁹⁶. An Irish Residence Permit costs 300 EUR per person each time (i.e. on registration and renewal)⁹⁷. For the IIP, successful applicants and their family members (if applicable) are given initial residence permission for two years. Following a review at that point to ensure the investor still meets the conditions of the scheme, a further period of three years will be granted. After this initial five-year period, the investor will be free to apply for residence indefinitely in five year periods⁹⁸. 	years provided the designated investment re- mained in place for the required time and condi- tions (b) and (c) above have been complied with. The immigration permission will be extended for further five year periods thereafter provided only that conditions (b) and (c) above are complied with ¹⁰⁸ .An Irish Residence Permit costs EUR 300 per person each time (i.e. on renewal) ¹⁰⁹ .		The IIP recognizes that applicants may have substantial business and financial interests outside of Ireland, therefore actual resi- dence in Ireland is not a condition for renew- al of residency. The applicant and family members are only required to visit Ireland once per calendar year ¹¹⁵ .

 ⁹⁶ Section 19(1) of the Immigration Act 2004, No.1 of 2004, available at: <u>http://www.irishstatutebook.ie/eli/2004/act/1/enacted/en/print</u>.
 ⁹⁷ 'Registration fee, payment & exemptions', Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service Website, available at: <u>http://www.inis.gov.ie/en/INIS/Pages/registration-fees</u>.

⁹⁸ Kathleen Garrett, 'Immigrant Investor Programme', January 2017, p. 1, available at: http://www.arthurcox.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/Immigrant-Investor-Programme-January-2017.pdf.

¹⁰⁸ Kathleen Garrett, 'Immigrant Investor Programme', January 2017, p. 3, available at: <u>http://www.arthurcox.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/Immigrant-Investor-Programme-January-</u> 2017.pdf.

¹⁰⁹ 'Registration fee, payment & exemptions', Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service Website, available at: http://www.inis.gov.ie/en/INIS/Pages/registration-fees.

4 DUE DILIGENCE CRITERIA AND SECURITY CONSIDERATIONS

Due diligence and security consider-	Procedure to verify due diligence and security considera-	Competent authorities and non-	Ex-post checks
ations	tions	public bodies	
In order to obtain residence permis- sion, the applicant must submit with their application a statement of character, both for themselves and for any family members, from the police authorities of each country in which they have resided for more than six months during the previous 10 years ¹¹⁶ . It is essential that applicants and their family members be of good character and that they have not been convicted of criminal offences in any jurisdiction ¹¹⁷ . They will also be required to arrange for the submission of an affidavit attesting to their good character and affirming that they have no criminal convictions where an applicant is successful in having their investment proposal approved.	Most due diligence and security checks are done in the applicant's home country and security reports are then submitted with their application form. Evidence of such checks is double-checked and verified by the Evaluation Committee at the application stage ¹²⁰ . Moreover, when investors make an application for residence permission they also make an application for a visa and normal visa checks are done at that stage. Initially they have to make a single-entry visa application from their country of origin– if there is an issue at that stage-through normal visa and security checks done through the Interpol database then they will be refused admission to Ireland which means they will not be able to take up the approval granted ¹²¹ . It should be noted that Ireland is not bound by the Visa Information System (VIS) Regulation ¹²² . Moreover, Ireland has not yet implemented the Schengen Information System (SIS) II but is carrying out preparatory activities to integrate into the SIS II for the purpose of law enforcement cooperation ¹²³ .	Most due diligence and security checks are done by an independent professional in the applicant's home country (financial agents e.g. ac- countants or solicitors) and evidence of such checks (e.g. security reports) are submitted with the application form. All persons receiving money in Ireland from a foreign source are also required by the Central Bank of Ire- land and the Department of Justice to ensure that they comply with anti- money laundering requirements - anyone accepting money into a fund is required to carry out an anti-money laundering check so that they know the source of the income. All of this is done prior to the person coming to INIS/Department of Justice ¹²⁸ .	Where people are entering and leaving Ireland on a re-entry visa, these are checked on a regular basis by the Department of Justice. These are the only ex- post checks that can be done and which are implemented to monitor abuses. The Department of Justice does not monitor ap- plicants once residence per-
This affidavit must be produced by a	Once the applicants arrive at the counter of registration in	The Evaluation Committee and IN-	mission has been
legal practitioner who is registered to	Ireland, another visa and security check will be done be-	IS/Department of Justice then double	granted. They
practice law in Ireland. A similar affi-	cause most of the applicants apply for a multi-entry visa	check this evidence submitted with	are only
davit will be required from all family	and they get a stamp 4 visa on that basis. Normal checks	the application form and INIS also	checked by the
members of 16 years of age or more	occur then. Those checks are done every time they regis-	carry out visa and security checks	Department of
who are availing of residence under	ter for residency renewal - i.e. they are obliged to register	when applicants arrive at the counter	Justice on the

115 Ibid.

¹¹⁶Kathleen Garrett, 'Immigrant Investor Programme', January 2017, p. 3, available at: http://www.arthurcox.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/Immigrant-Investor-Programme-January-2017.pdf; O'Grady Solicitors, 'Irish Investor and Entrepreneur Immigration Schemes' undated, 5, available at: p. http://ogradysolicitors.ie/uploads/files/articles/Irish%20Investor%20and%20Entrepreneur%20Immigration%20Schemes.pdf.

¹¹⁷Padraig Hoare, 'Immigrant investor scheme approvals down', 26 January 2017, Press Release, available at: https://www.irishexaminer.com/business/immigrant-investor-scheme-approvalsdown-440864.html; Kathleen Garrett, 'Immigrant Investor Programme', January 2017, p. 3, available at: <u>http://www.arthurcox.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/Immigrant-Investor-</u> Programme-January-2017.pdf.

Due diligence and security consider- ations	Procedure to verify due diligence and security considera- tions	Competent authorities and non- public bodies	Ex-post checks
the scheme. Residence permission will not be issued by INIS until this affi- davit has been submitted ¹¹⁸ .	on the anniversary after two years and again three years after that and again five years after that ¹²⁴ . Applications may be turned down on the basis of due	of registration of residence and when renewing their residence permission. The only scrutiny mechanisms and	registration anni- versaries - (i.e. two years and again three
The applicant must provide evidence of the funds that are to be used for the proposed investment/funding, evidence of the provenance of those funds and evidence that the funds are transferrable to Ireland and con- vertible to euros as part of their ap-	diligence checks and residency status under the IIP will be therefore withdrawn from the beneficiary in the following circumstances:i) If the acquisition of the status was fraudulent;ii) In the event of the holder being the subject of a deportation order;iii) In the event of the holder being convicted of a criminal	reporting obligations in place are those already indicated.	years after that and again five years after that ¹²⁹) based on the criteria indi- cated under point 3 above.
plication. Anti-money laundering checks, including evidence and provenance of funds are done by an independent professional (e.g. ac- countants, solicitors) in their home country and evidence that all infor- mation is provided of such checks is checked by the Evaluation Commit- tee at the application stage. ¹¹⁹	offence; iv) If the applicant fails to meet the conditions of the scheme as regards duration of the investment; and v) If the investor failed to disclose material information available to them at the time of the application, that would if known to the immigration authorities have made them ineligible for the programme on the grounds of character. ¹²⁵		There have been no cases where a misuse associ- ated with corrup- tion and fraud has been report- ed ¹³⁰ .
	Where INIS is not satisfied with an element of the applica- tion, they can and do return the applications stating that this person would not satisfy their security checks ¹²⁶ . This		

¹²⁰ Information obtained through consultation with national stakeholder (Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service, 17 April 2018).

¹²¹ Ibid; 'New passport data checks at Dublin airport to combat jihadi terror threat', Irish Independent Website, available at: https://www.independent.ie/irish-news/new-passport-data-checks-atdublin-airport-to-combat-jihadi-terror-threat-35310776.html.

¹²² Recital 30 of Regulation (EC) No 767/2008 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 9 July 2008 concerning the Visa Information System (VIS) and the exchange of data between Member States on short-stay visas (VIS Regulation), OJ L 218/60, 13 August 2008, available at: <u>https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/PDF/?uri=CELEX:32008R0767&from=EN</u>.
 ¹²³ 'Schengen Convention', Data Protection Commission Website, available at: <u>https://www.dataprotection.ie/docs/Schengen/188.htm</u>.
 ¹²⁸ Ibid

ibia.									
¹¹⁸ INIS,	'Immigrant	Investor	Programme:	Guidelines',	January	2018,	p.18,	available	at:
	gov.ie/en/INIS/Immig	rant%20Investor%20	Programme%20(IIP)%2	OGuidelines.pdf/Files/In	nmigrant%20Investor	r%20Programme%	<u>620(IIP)%20Guic</u>	<u>lelines.pdf</u> .	
¹¹⁹ Ibid.									
¹²⁴ Ibid.									
¹²⁵ INIS,	'Immigrant	Investor	Programme:	Guidelines',	January	2018,	p.23,	available	at:
http://www.inis.g	gov.ie/en/INIS/Immig	rant%20Investor%20	Programme%20(IIP)%2	OGuidelines.pdf/Files/In	nmigrant%20Investor	r%20Programme%	<u>%20(IIP)%20Guio</u>	lelines.pdf.	
126 T C		1		1	a . 17 . 17	010			

¹²⁶ Information obtained through consultation with national stakeholder (Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service, 17 April 2018).

Due diligence and security consider-	Procedure to verify due diligence and security considera-	Competent authorities and non-	Ex-post checks
ations	tions	public bodies	
	would, however, be on an individual basis on examining the documents presented ¹²⁷ .		

 ¹²⁹ Ibid.
 ¹³⁰ Information obtained through consultation with national stakeholder (Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service, 17 April 2018).
 ¹²⁷ Ibid.

III. RIGHTS GRANTED BY THE PERMITS

1 RIGHTS GRANTED TO INVESTORS

Investors are granted residency permission under "Stamp 4" conditions. According to Section 4(6) of the Immigration Act 2004, 'an immigration officer may, on behalf of the Minister, by a notice in writing to a non-national, or an **inscription** placed on his or her passport or other equivalent document, attach to a permission under this section such **conditions** as to duration of stay and engagement in employment, business or a profession in the State as he or she may think fit, and may by such a notice or inscription at any time amend such conditions as aforesaid in such manner as he or she may think fit, and the non-national shall comply with such conditions.¹³¹

Residency under "Stamp 4" permits investors to work, study, access state funds and services as determined by Government departments or agencies, start and conduct their own business in Ireland (i.e. the right to be self-employed, to market access and to be active in the business), and reside in Ireland on a full-time basis without the requirement to get a work permit¹³². It is noted that applicants under this programme do not have access to social security¹³³. Stamp 4 conditions do not explicitly state that investors are entitled to access healthcare- it says that they can access state funds and services as determined by government departments or agencies¹³⁴. It could be inferred that this includes access to healthcare-however this is not explicitly stated or determined in any of the sources found through desk research. If an investor or his/her family member becomes a citizen of Ireland they will have the right to access health care and social security as any other Irish citizen¹³⁵.

The IIP does not provide visa-required nationals with an entitlement to travel to and within the UK (including Northern Ireland) or the rest of the EU without an entry visa (if required). Therefore, holders of a Stamp 4 residence permit obtained through the IIP will be required to apply for visas to enter other countries as required. There are, however, certain agreements between the UK and Ireland with respect to immigration, for example, the "British Irish Visa Scheme" which allows Chinese and Indian citizens to travel to and around the Common Travel Area on a single visa (as opposed to requiring separate Irish and UK visas)¹³⁶.

2 RIGHTS GRANTED TO THE INVESTORS' FAMILY MEMBERS

If the applicant is granted residency permission under Stamp 4 and the rights stemming from it, their family members are also granted residency permission under Stamp 4 and the same rights¹³⁷. There-

¹³¹ Section 4(6) of the Immigration Act 2004, No.1 of 2004, available at: <u>http://www.irishstatutebook.ie/eli/2004/act/1/enacted/en/print</u>.

¹³² Permanent Residency by Investment in Ireland', Elma Global Website, available at: <u>https://www.second-citizenship.org/permanent-residence/permanent-residency-by-investment-in-ireland/</u>; Information obtained through consultation with national stakeholder (Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service, 17 April 2018); 'Permission, stamps and conditions', Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service website, available at: http://www.inis.gov.ie/en/INIS/Pages/registration-stamps#stamp4.

¹³³ European Migration Network, 2015, 'Admitting third-country nationals for business purposes', p. 40 and 48, available at: <u>http://www.emn.lv/wpcontent/uploads/emn_study_admitting_thirdcountry_nationals_for_business_purposes_synthesis_repo</u> <u>rt_vf_04may2015.pdf</u>.

 ¹³⁴ Permission, stamps and conditions', Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service website, available at: http://www.inis.gov.ie/en/INIS/Pages/registration-stamps#stamp4.
 ¹³⁵ Ibid.

¹³⁶ Kathleen Garrett, 'Immigrant Investor Programme', January 2017, p. 3, available at: <u>http://www.arthurcox.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/Immigrant-Investor-Programme-January-2017.pdf</u>.

¹³⁷ Information obtained through consultation with national stakeholder (Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service, 17 April 2018).

fore, family members will be granted immediate family reunification and will benefit from their own permission to work, study in secondary and tertiary education, access state funds and services as determined by Government departments or agencies, establish a business in Ireland as they wish (i.e. the right to be self-employed, to market access and to be active in the business), and reside in Ireland on a full-time basis without the requirement to get a work permit¹³⁸. However, similarly to the investors, their family members do not have access to social security¹³⁹.

3 OTHER BENEFITS

With regard to the IIP, an investor may avail of a discount on their investment for educational expenses that they intend to commit to in Ireland. The following conditions apply:

- Investors may discount their approved investment with eligible education expenses that they commit
- to incur within the first five years after their permission has been granted;
- The education expenses must be for an Irish University or Institute of Technology;
- The expenses must be for an investor and/or family member who has been accepted on an academic programme in one of the above educational institutions (i.e. they must have a letter of confirmation from the tertiary education institute or university that the investor and/or family member will commence a course at the beginning of the next academic year);
- The maximum discount allowable is EUR 50,000 bringing the investment down to EUR 950,000;
- Retrospective education expenses cannot be included¹⁴⁰.

There are no special tax regimes for applicants and their family members¹⁴¹. Ireland taxes non-habitual residents only for Ireland-based income and has a corporate tax rate of 12.5%¹⁴².

¹³⁸ 'Permanent Residency by Investment in Ireland', Elma Global Website, available at: https://www.secondcitizenship.org/permanent-residence/permanent-residency-by-investment-in-ireland/; Kathleen Garrett, 'Immigrant Investor Programme', January 2017, p. 3, available at: http://www.arthurcox.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/Immigrant-Investor-Programme-January-2017.pdf; Information obtained through consultation with national stakeholder (Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service, 17 April 2018); Aoife Gillespie, 'Immigrant Investor Programme (IIP)', 14 June 2017, available at:https://www.philiplee.ie/the-immigrant-investor-programme-iip/.

¹³⁹ European Migration Network, 2015, 'Admitting third-country nationals for business purposes', p. 40 and 48, available at: <u>http://www.emn.lv/wpcontent/uploads/emn_study_admitting_thirdcountry_nationals_for_business_purposes_synthesis_repo</u> <u>rt_vf_04may2015.pdf</u>.

¹⁴⁰ Information obtained through consultation with national stakeholder (Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service, 17 April 2018); O'Grady Solicitors, 'Irish Investor and Entrepreneur Immigration Schemes', undated, p. 3, available at: <u>http://ogradysolicitors.ie/uploads/files/articles/Irish%20Investor%20and%20Entrepreneur%20Immigration%20Schemes.pdf</u>. ¹⁴¹ Information obtained through consultation with national stakeholder (Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service, 17 April 2018).

¹⁴² Džankić, J., 2018, 'Immigrant investor programmes in the European Union (EU)', Journal of Contemporary European Studies, p.75-76, available at: <u>http://www.tandfonline.com/eprint/RCamn4KukKTzWBIGqjF4/full</u>.

IV. INTERACTION BETWEEN RESIDENCE AND CITIZENSHIP SCHEMES

Ireland does not grant holders of residence permits obtained under the IIP a specific right to obtain citizenship¹⁴³. The IIP does not provide for preferential access to naturalisation for successful applicants. Therefore, there is no link between residence obtained under the IIP and citizenship in Ireland. This is due to the fact that investors and their family members who exercise their right not to reside in Ireland under the IIP will not fulfil the residency requirements for naturalisation¹⁴⁴. According to a stakeholder consulted, almost 91% of applications are from Chinese applicants and they never gain citizenship out of this programme¹⁴⁵.

Successful applicants are free to apply for naturalisation in the normal manner under the provisions of the Irish Nationality and Citizenship Acts 1957-2004¹⁴⁶. Article 15(1)(c) of this legislation requires applicants for Irish naturalisation to be physically resident in Ireland for the 12 months prior to application and to be physically resident in Ireland for four of the preceding eight years ¹⁴⁷. Moreover, in order to be granted Irish citizenship through naturalisation, an applicant is generally required to meet each of the following criteria (in addition to the residence requirement):

- Applicants must be of full age (i.e. 18 years or older, or married if younger than 18);
- Applicants must be of good character/no criminal convictions (the Garda Síochána (Irish police force) are asked to provide a report on the background of all applicants);
- Applicants must intend in good faith to continue to reside in the State after naturalisation;
- Applicants must make a declaration of fidelity to the nation and loyalty to the State and avow to
 observe the nation's laws and values¹⁴⁸.

¹⁴⁶ Irish Nationality and Citizenship Act 1956, No. 26 of 1956 as amended by the Irish National and Citizenship Act 1986 (No. 23 of 1986), the Irish Nationality and Citizenship Act 1994 (No.9 of 29914), the Irish Nationality and Citizenship Act 2001 (No. 15 of 2001), the Irish Nationality and Citizenship Act 2004 (No. 38 of 2004) and the Civil Law (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 2011 (No. 23 of 2011), available at: http://www.inis.gov.ie/en/INIS/INCA%20Dec2014.pdf/Files/INCA%20Dec2014.pdf.

¹⁴³ Information obtained through consultation with national stakeholder (Irish Naturalisation & Immigration Service, 17 April 2018).

¹⁴⁴ INIS, 'Immigrant Investor Programme: Guidelines', January 2018, p.22, available at: http://www.inis.gov.ie/en/INIS/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf/Files/Immigrant%20Inv estor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf.

¹⁴⁵ Information obtained through consultation with national stakeholder (Irish Naturalisation & Immigration Service, 17 April 2018).

¹⁴⁷Article 15(1)(c) of the Irish Nationality and Citizenship Act 1956, No. 26 of 1956 as amended by the Irish National and Citizenship Act 1986 (No. 23 of 1986), the Irish Nationality and Citizenship Act 1994 (No.9 of 29914), the Irish Nationality and Citizenship Act 2001 (No. 15 of 2001), the Irish Nationality and Citizenship Act 2004 (No. 38 of 2004) and the Civil Law (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 2011 (No. 23 of 2011), available at: 'Immigrant Investor http://www.inis.gov.ie/en/INIS/INCA%20Dec2014.pdf/Files/INCA%20Dec2014.pdf; INIS, Programme: p.26, Guidelines', January 2018, available at: http://www.inis.gov.ie/en/INIS/Immigrant%20Investor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf/Files/Immigrant%20Inv estor%20Programme%20(IIP)%20Guidelines.pdf; O'Grady Solicitors, 'Irish Investor and Entrepreneur Immigration Schemes', undated, 6, available at: p. http://ogradysolicitors.ie/uploads/files/articles/Irish%20Investor%20and%20Entrepreneur%20Immigration%20Schemes.pdf; Carrera, S., 2014, 'How much does EU citizenship cost? The Maltese citizenship-for-sale affair: a breakthrough for sincere cooperation in citizenship of the Union', Liberty and Security in Europe Paper No. 64, p.47, available at: https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=2430117.

¹⁴⁸ Kathleen Garrett, 'Immigrant Investor Programme', January 2017, p. 4, available at: <u>http://www.arthurcox.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/Immigrant-Investor-Programme-January-2017.pdf</u>.

V. ECONOMIC AND FINANCIAL EFFICIENCY OF RESIDENCE PERMITS FOR FOR-EIGN INVESTORS

No legislation or implementing measures establish any mechanism to monitor the economic impact and financial revenues of investors who have been granted residence in Ireland¹⁴⁹. Similarly, no studies have been carried out to assess the economic and financial efficiency of residence schemes in Ireland¹⁵⁰.

Although the IIP was established in 2012, it has only been in full operation since the middle of 2016 and therefore it is too soon to determine whether it has met the expectations for which it was created in practice¹⁵¹. Some of the projects under the IIP can take some time to set up. For example, the Department of Justice can give their approval on a project and eight or nine months might pass before the investor arrives in Ireland. Therefore, the entity will only receive the investment at this stage. The project would only commence thereafter. It can therefore take 18 months to two years before any results of the project can be seen¹⁵².

The economic and financial efficiency of the IIP is probably measurable on the basis of how much money is going in, when it is going in and looking at this over a five-year period and what the impact of this funding has been. This is not within the competence of the Department of Justice. It is a matter for the Department of Finance or the Economic and Social Research Institute (ESRI). It is considered too soon to determine any economic and financial efficiency as the scheme has been in operation for only 18 months and some of these projects will only be commencing now¹⁵³.

According to one stakeholder consulted, the economic efficiency of investors' residence schemes could be measured by the creation of jobs, however it probably will not be measured in practice (and not by the Department of Justice)¹⁵⁴. Jobs have (and will be) created in the building sector. Moreover, for example through a project concerning the creation of a nursing home, jobs will also be created for the running of the nursing home (administrative support, nurses). What jobs will be created will depend on the specific project concerned¹⁵⁵.

Since the scheme has been in operation, there have been a large number of successful applications: since June 2016 a total of 506 applications have been submitted and 482 have been decided with 24 awaiting final decision¹⁵⁶. The Evaluation Committee has recommended approval in respect of 405 of these applications for a total investment value of EUR 285.45m¹⁵⁷. No further information regarding successful applications in 2016 and 2017 is available. Successful applications have meant an income of over EUR 400 million through the IIP¹⁵⁸.

A breakdown of the number and value of IIP applications and total investment per annum under each investment option is provided in the Table 2 below¹⁵⁹.

¹⁴⁹ Information obtained through consultation with national stakeholder (Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service, 17 April 2018).

¹⁵⁰ Ibid.; Information obtained through consultation with national stakeholder (Central Bank of Ireland, 17 April 2018).

¹⁵¹ Ibid.

¹⁵² Ibid.

¹⁵³ Information obtained through consultation with national stakeholder (Irish Naturalisation and Immigration Service, 17 April 2018).

¹⁵⁴ Ibid.

¹⁵⁵ Ibid.

¹⁵⁶ 'Parliamentary Question 263: 3 October 2017', 'Department of Justice and Equality Website, available at: http://www.justice.ie/en/JELR/Pages/PQ-03-10-2017-263.

¹⁵⁷ Ibid.

¹⁵⁸ Ibid.

¹⁵⁹ 'Parliamentary Question 262: 23 January 2018', Department of Justice and Equality website, available at: http://www.justice.ie/en/JELR/Pages/PQ-23-01-2018-262.

	No. of applications			Total Investment ¹⁶⁰				
Year	No. appli- cations	No. successful applications ¹⁶¹	Endowment	Enterprise	Mixed Investment	Bond	Other	
2012	N/A	5	2 (€1.0m)	3 (€3.0m)	-	-	-	€11.0m
2013	N/A	14	2 (€1.0m)	9 (€4.5m)	7 (€5.25m)	2 (€2.0m)	-	€83.25m
2014	N/A	23	-	26 (€13.0m)	3 (€2.25m)	1 (€1.0m)	-	€344.75m
2015	67	65	1 (€0.5m)	56 (€28.0m)	4 (€3.0m)	3 (€3.0m)	3 (€1.5m) Fund	€1,594m
2016	317		5 (€2.0m)	249 (€124.5m)	28 (€21.0m)	10 (€10.0m)	24 (€24.0m) Fund 1 (€2.0m) REIT	€32,276.5m
2017	334	N/A	46 (€19.2m)	261 (€261.0m)	-	-	26 (€26.0m) Fund 1 (€2.0m) REIT	

Table 2 IIP applications per annum and investment option and total investment

Therefore, it is reasonable to assume that the programme has had a significant impact on boosting Ireland's economy¹⁶². It may also be concluded that in addition to job creation the IIP also creates business for solicitors and other non-public bodies involved in the application process.

¹⁶⁰ 'Parliamentary Question 2271/17', Parliamentary Questions Website, available at: http://www.parliamentary-questions.com/question/2271-17/.

 ¹⁶¹ 'Parliamentary Question 263: 3 October 2017', 'Department of Justice and Equality Website, available at: <u>http://www.justice.ie/en/JELR/Pages/PQ-03-10-2017-263</u>; 'Parliamentary Question 99: 8 February 2017', 'Department of Justice and Equality Website, available at: <u>http://www.justice.ie/en/JELR/Pages/PQ-03-10-2017-263</u>; 'Parliamentary Question 2017', 'Department of Justice and Equality Website, available at: <u>http://www.justice.ie/en/JELR/Pages/PQ-03-10-2017-263</u>; 'Parliamentary Question 2017', 'Department of Justice and Equality Website, available at: <u>http://www.justice.ie/en/JELR/Pages/PQ-03-10-2017-263</u>; 'Parliamentary Question 2017', 'Department of Justice and Equality Website, available at: <u>http://www.justice.ie/en/JELR/Pages/PQ-03-10-2017-263</u>; 'Parliamentary Question 2017', 'Department of Justice and Equality Website, available at: <u>http://www.justice.ie/en/JELR/Pages/PQ-08-02-2017-99</u>;

¹⁶² Ibid; Information obtained through consultation with national stakeholder (Central Statistics Office Ireland, 12 April 2018).